PROOF OVER PROMISE: DATA SOURCES AND METRICS IN RESEARCH EVALUATION

Professor Anne-Wil Harzing
Middlesex University
www.harzing.com
Why are citations as important as journals ranks? [proof over promise]

What’s the difference between ISI, Scopus and Google Scholar

What is a h-index, why is hla better?

How can I use Publish or Perish to

- Track my own citations? (http://www.harzing.com/popbook/ch3.htm)
- Present my case for confirmation or promotion? (http://www.harzing.com/popbook/ch7.htm)
- Ensure I don’t miss key publications in the journal I am submitting to? (http://www.harzing.com/popbook/ch10_3.htm)
- Prepare for a meeting with an academic I don’t know? (http://www.harzing.com/popbook/ch8_1.htm)
- Systematically store queries so I can run them again? (http://www.harzing.com/popbook/ch6_2_3.htm)
PROOF OVER PROMISE

- Publication in AMR/ASQ/AMJ (ranked A***, JIF very high) only means that 3 or 4 individuals thought your work was a quality contribution to the field, what if very few academics subsequently cite your paper?
  - Publication in e.g. *Journal of Managerial Psychology* (ranked C, not ISI-listed till 2009) with 1950 citations means that nearly 2,000 individuals thought your work was useful to the field.
  - Granted, the 4 individuals might be real experts, but if very few other academics cite your work, I would still argue you have made a more important contribution in the second case.

- Farfetched? No it’s a real-life example, four articles all published in 2007

- In fact only ONE of the articles published in AMJ/ASQ/AMR that year (Eisenhardt’s paper on case study research) matched the JMP article in terms of citations.

- For more info see:
GS TO COMPLEMENT ISI WHY (I)?

- **WoS General Search is limited to ISI-listed journals**
  - Citations to books, book chapters, dissertations, theses, working papers, reports, conference papers, and journal articles published in non-ISI journals are not included.
  - Of the journals included in my JQL, ISI coverage runs from 30%-43% for Finance & Accounting, Management & Marketing to 73%-80% for Eco, MIS, Mgt Science/OR/Ops.

- **WoS Cited Reference Search**
  - Does include citations to non-ISI publications. However, it only includes citations from journals that are ISI-listed.

- **WoS has very limited coverage of non-English sources**
  - e.g., one French Accounting academic has 30 cites in ISI, but >1000 in GS as most of the citations are in French journals.
  - Non-English coverage is particularly important for disciplines with a strong local content such as accounting and industrial relations.

- **WoS has very poor aggregation of minor variations of the same title/name**
  - “Stray” citations are very common.
  - Books suffer from frequent typos in data entry: Culture’s consequences > 200 instances: Clotures Consequence, Clutral Consequenc, Culultures Consequenc, Cult Consequences In, Culture’s consequences.
GS TO COMPLEMENT ISI WHY (2)?
TIMELINESS OF GOOGLE SCHOLAR

- Google Scholar captures citations as soon as they appear on the web, including online first, working papers, conference papers etc.
  - Costas, Rodrigo, Zohreh Zahedi, and Paul Wouters. "Do “altmetrics” correlate with citations? ......." *Journal of the Association for Information Science and Technology* (2014), Online first
    - 41 Google Scholar citations
    - Article not yet included in WoS, no WoS citations
    - 58 Google Scholar citations
    - 9 WoS citations

- Scopos has a wider coverage of Business journals than ISI, but still does not include as many journals as Google Scholar and does not include non-journal publications
DIFFERENT DATA SOURCES: DOES IT REALLY MATTER? YES IT DOES....
GOOGLE SCHOLAR FOR INDIVIDUALS
WHAT MEASURES TO USE?

- H-index increasingly seen as a convenient summary of quantity & impact and used in many research assessments
  - H-index of 10 means 10 papers with at least 10 citations each
  - Can be adjusted for co-authorships (hi norm) and for age of paper (hc index) or for both co-authorship and professional age (hla = annualised individual h-index)

- Total citations is probably the fairest way to assess impact for individuals
  - Focus on citations per paper might discourage people to publish additional papers
  - Can be adjusted by years (Total citations/years active) and number of authors (Sum of citations for each paper divided by the number of authors)
  - Only relevant for more senior researchers; own example, published since 1995:
    - in the first five years I had about 20 ISI citations
    - in the next five years I had about 125 ISI citations
    - in the last five years I had nearly 2000 ISI citations
4. A NEW METRIC: INDIVIDUAL ANNUAL H-INDEX

- Harzing, Alakangas & Adams (2014) propose hIa: Individual annual h-index
  - Corrects the h-index for co-authorship and length of academic career
    - The average number of single-author equivalent impactful publications per year, hence a hIa of more than one shows excellent research performance
  - Provides a more reliable comparison between disciplines (see graph, based on a sample of 150 Associate and Full Professors at the University of Melbourne)
  - For more details see: DOI 10.1007/s11192-013-1208-0
MORE INFORMATION?

- Chapter 1: Introduction to citation analysis
- Chapter 2: Introduction to Publish or Perish
- Chapter 3: Author searches
- Chapter 4: Journal searches
- Chapter 5: General citation search queries
- Chapter 6: Multi-query centre
- **Chapter 7: Making your case for tenure or promotion**
- Chapter 8: How to evaluate other academics?
- **Chapter 9: Tips for deans and other academic administrators**
- **Chapter 10: Where to submit your paper?**
- **Chapter 11: Conducting a literature review**
- Chapter 12: Doing bibliometric research on authors & journals
- Chapter 13: Evaluating Google Scholar
- Chapter 14: Evaluating Thomson ISI Web of Science
- Chapter 15: A Google Scholar h-index for journals
- Chapter 16: Author citation analysis across disciplines

Now available online:
http://www.harzing.com/popbook/index.htm